



THE CHURCH  
OF ENGLAND



The **Methodist** Church 

# Inspection Report

St Michael's Llandaff  
Coleg Mihangel Sant

February 2009

**Ministry Division  
Church House  
Great Smith Street  
London SW1P 3AZ  
Tel: 020 7898 1412  
Fax: 020 7898 1421**

**Published 2009 by the Ministry Division of the Archbishops' Council  
Copyright © The Archbishops' Council 2009**

## CONTENTS

GLOSSARY.....	ii
LIST OF INSPECTORS.....	iii
THE INSPECTION FRAMEWORK.....	1
JOINT INTRODUCTION.....	3
SUMMARY.....	5
FULL REPORT.....	9
INTRODUCTION.....	9
A AIMS, OBJECTIVES AND ACHIEVEMENTS OF THE INSTITUTION....	14
B RELATIONSHIPS WITH OTHER INSTITUTIONS.....	17
C GOVERNANCE, MANAGEMENT, CONSTITUTION & ORGANISATION	20
D ACCOMMODATION.....	23
E COMMUNITY AND CORPORATE LIFE.....	25
F COMMON WORSHIP.....	28
G MINISTERIAL, PERSONAL AND SPIRITUAL FORMATION.....	31
H TEACHING AND LEARNING: CONTENT, METHOD & RESOURCES..	36
J PRACTICAL AND PASTORAL THEOLOGY.....	42
K TRAINING IN PUBLIC WORSHIP.....	44
L TEACHING STAFF.....	45
M ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF.....	48
N STUDENTS.....	50
O CONCLUSION.....	51
LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS.....	53

## GLOSSARY

Cytûn	Churches together in Wales
SWBC	South Wales Baptist College
NAM	Newly Accredited Ministers
BUGB	Baptist Union of Great Britain
AHRC	Arts and Humanities Research Council
ESRC	The Economic and Social Research Council
CME	Continuing Ministerial Education
IME	Initial Ministerial Education
ICME	Initial and Continuing Ministerial Education
RELIG	Cardiff University School of Religious and Theological Studies
ASQC	Academic Standards and Quality Committee
PRLT	Peer Review of Learning and Teaching
VAK	Visual, Auditory and Kinaesthetic
KAAP	Knowledge, Analysis, Argumentation and Presentation

## **LIST OF INSPECTORS**

**The Revd Canon Dr Richard France** *Senior Inspector*  
Church of England and Church in Wales.

**The Revd Dr Mary Cotes**  
Baptist Church. Ecumenical Moderator of the Milton Keynes Churches' Council

**The Revd Canon Val Hamer**  
Church in Wales. Diocesan Missioner, Diocese of Llandaff

**The Revd Margaret Jones**  
Ministry Advisor, the Discipleship & Ministries Cluster, the Methodist Connexional Team

**The Ven Judith Rose**  
Church of England. Formerly Archdeacon of Tonbridge and recently Moderator of Reader training in the diocese of Bath & Wells.

**The Ven Christopher Smith**  
Church in Wales. Archdeacon of Morgannwg, Diocese of Llandaff



# THE INSPECTIONS FRAMEWORK

On behalf of the sponsoring churches, inspection teams are asked to assess the fitness for purpose of the training institution for preparing candidates for ordained and licensed ministry and to make recommendations for the enhancement of the life and work of the institution,

Within the structures of the Baptist Union of Great Britain, this report is prepared for the Ministry Executive of the Council of the Baptist Union of Great Britain.

In coming to their judgments, inspectors are asked to use the following three outcomes: **confidence**, **confidence with qualifications**, and **no confidence**. These are applied both for the overall outcome and at the level of individual criteria:

## **Confidence**

Overall outcome: a number of recommendations, none of which question the generally high standards found in the inspection.

Criteria level: aspects of an institution's life which show good or best practice.

## **Confidence with qualifications**

Overall outcome: A number of recommendations, including one or more of substance that questions the generally acceptable standards found in the inspection and which can be rectified or substantially addressed by the institution in the coming 12 months.

Criteria level: aspects of an institution's life which show either (a) at least satisfactory practice but with some parts which are not satisfactory or (b) some unsatisfactory practice but where the institution has the capacity to address the issues within 12 months.

## **No confidence**

Overall outcome: A number of recommendations, including one or more of substance which raise significant questions about the standards found in the inspection and the capacity of the institution to rectify or substantially address these in the coming 12 months.

Criteria level: aspects of an institution's life which show either (a) generally not satisfactory practice or (b) some unsatisfactory practice where it is not evident that the institution can rectify the issues within the coming 12 months.



**THE INSPECTION OF  
ST. MICHAEL'S COLLEGE, LLANDAFF and the  
SOUTH WALES BAPTIST COLLEGE**

**March 2009**

**INTRODUCTION to the two reports**

St Michael's College, Llandaff and the South Wales Baptist College are linked through their partnership in the Faculty of Religious and Theological Studies of Cardiff University, within which both colleges deliver the bulk of their teaching programme. It was therefore agreed that the two colleges should be inspected together by the same team of inspectors, and this report accordingly covers both colleges. The inspectors concluded, however, that the two institutions are so differently structured that it would not be appropriate to consider them side by side under each of the headings of the report. We have accordingly drawn up separate reports on the two colleges, each with its own recommendations. We have, however, endeavoured at all times to keep the relationship of the two colleges in mind, and some paragraphs and a few recommendations will be expressed in the same words with regard to both colleges. Both reports use the agreed headings drawn up for the inspection of colleges and courses by the Quality in Formation Panel on behalf of the Church of England, the Methodist Church and the Baptist Union of Great Britain.



# THE REPORT OF THE INSPECTION OF ST MICHAEL'S COLLEGE LLANDAFF

March 2009

## SUMMARY

### Introduction

St Michael's College trains candidates for ministry, both ordained and lay, in the Anglican and Methodist Churches. Both residential and non-residential modes of training are offered. St Michael's is the provincial training college for the Church in Wales, and the majority of its Anglican students come from that church, but it also welcomes students from the Church of England. At the time of the inspection, 9-13 March 2009, there were 28 resident ordinands (one of whom was Methodist) and 47 ordinands and trainee Readers (including one Methodist student minister) on the non-residential course.

### Summary of outcomes

The inspection team regards St Michael's College as fit for the purpose of preparing candidates for ordained and licensed ministry.

CRITERIA	OUTCOME
A. Aims, objectives and evaluation of the institution	Confidence
B. Relationships with other institutions	Confidence
C. Governance, management, constitution and organisation	Confidence
D. Accommodation	Confidence with qualifications
E. Community and corporate life	Confidence with qualifications
F. Common worship	Confidence
G. Ministerial, personal and spiritual formation	Confidence with qualifications
H. Teaching and learning: content, method and resources	Confidence
J. Practical and Pastoral Theology	Confidence
K. Training in public worship	Confidence
L. Teaching staff	Confidence with qualifications
M. Administrative staff	Confidence
N. Students	Confidence

<b>Overall outcome</b>	<b>Confidence with qualifications</b>
------------------------	---------------------------------------

### General observations

The college has developed greatly over recent years. In addition to its core purpose of training for ordination and Reader ministry it also hosts a nationally important Centre for Chaplaincy Studies; it has undertaken responsibility for ministry development and in-service training for the whole Church in Wales; and it organises courses to stimulate vocations to ministry. The non-residential training course which it runs

for all but one dioceses of the Church in Wales (replacing and extending the former South Wales Ordination Course) involves the delivery of the programme in two centres in Carmarthen and Wrexham as well as in Cardiff. St Michael's College is therefore a much more complex organisation than the relatively modest number of residential students suggests, with some 200 students taking its courses over the last year. Both in the complexity of its organisation and in its ethos it is a very different college from the St Michael's of twenty years ago, and the rapid pace of change is continuing.

### **Response to the last inspection**

The rapid development of the college means that much of what was said by the inspectors in 2003 no longer applies. The inspectors at that time drew attention to the heavy workload of the academic staff; the recent developments have reconfigured the staff's responsibilities, and added significant additional administrative help. However the problem of workload identified in previous reports remains. The inspectors were concerned that a sufficient breadth of church traditions, both Anglican and Methodist, should be evident in the college's teaching and worship, and that has been largely achieved; the college now claims with some justification to be an 'all-party' college. Recommendations relating to the proper criteria and review of ministerial formation have been creatively addressed, as have the inspectors' concerns about the provision for the professional development of teaching staff. Where specific organisational changes were recommended they have been implemented. The college responded well to the inspectors' recommendations, but in any case the college has moved on since 2003.

### **Strengths**

- a well-motivated and creative staff under firm but sensitive leadership.
- the 'joined-up thinking' about ministry and ministerial formation which underlies the recent diversification of the college's operation, and which well embodies key insights of the Hind Report.
- a strong administrative staff team, well suited to resourcing the rapidly developing range of college activities.
- the close relationship which exists between the college and the Church in Wales, for which the college provides a wide-ranging ministry resource going far beyond pre-ordination training.
- the clear-sighted commitment of the Church in Wales to resourcing this important contribution to its wider mission.
- a healthy working relationship with the other constituent members of the Cardiff University Faculty of Religious Studies and Theology.
- high quality teaching which has resulted in academic achievements out of proportion to the college's size.

- a Core Skills programme which provides a valuable context for ministerial formation.
- the creation and development of the Centre for Chaplaincy Studies.
- the newly-introduced portfolio system as a way of charting and assessing personal and ministerial development.
- a generous openness to the range of traditions in the sponsoring churches.

### **Areas for attention**

- the danger of over-busyness which faces both staff and students, arising both from the heavy demands of the essential training programme and from the diversification of the college's activities; the need for 'space'.
- the pastoral care of students and the monitoring of their formation for ministry, including in particular a rethinking of the function and effectiveness of the tutorial groups.
- the need to discover the best means to enable such a diverse community to live together with differences of view and of tradition.
- the need, when opportunity arises, to make the teaching staff more representative by appointing an ordained woman and a fluent Welsh-speaker.
- the need to clarify the criteria and learning outcomes for the training of Readers.
- the need to explore a wider range of placements outside traditional parish settings.
- the urgent need for improvements and alterations to the college buildings, and in particular to the residential accommodation.
- the continuing financial insecurity of the college, and the need to recruit a larger number of residential students so as to reach a sustainable level of fee income.
- the need for a suitably democratic structure in the student body.

# FULL REPORT

## INTRODUCTION

1 St Michael's College has been in existence since 1892 as a residential college for the training of candidates for ordained ministry in the Anglican church (originally only for the Diocese of Llandaff), which since disestablishment in 1920 has meant primarily the Church in Wales. It is currently the policy of the Bench of Bishops of the Church in Wales that all candidates for stipendiary ministry in Wales should train through St Michael's unless there are exceptional circumstances. The college has however also been open to receiving ordinands from outside Wales, and in recent years a small number of Church of England ordinands have been trained here; the college has a policy actively to recruit ordinands from Church of England dioceses. The Methodist Church has for several years also been integrally involved in the college, which is one of the recognised places of training for Methodist ministerial candidates.

2 The residential student body currently comprises 23 Church in Wales ordinands (three of whom are candidates for non-stipendiary ministry), 4 Church of England ordinands, and one Methodist student minister. The Methodist Church has recently decided to concentrate its residential training in three English colleges, and so will in the future no longer send residential students for training at St Michael's other than in exceptional circumstances.

3 In recent years the college has deliberately and substantially expanded its activities. It is now organised into four teams, each headed by a Dean, which are described in the following paragraphs, and which demonstrate the wide range of aspects of training for and development of ministry which the college now undertakes on behalf of the Church in Wales and more widely.

### 4 Residential Training.

This, the traditional mode of operation of the college, remains the normal pathway for candidates for stipendiary ordained ministry.

### 5 Non-residential Training.

Since the last inspection the college has taken over responsibility for the non-residential training of non-stipendiary ordinands and candidates for Reader ministry in the dioceses of Llandaff, Monmouth, Swansea and Brecon and St Davids which was previously delivered through the South Wales Ordination Course. In addition, the non-residential training previously organised separately in St Asaph Diocese has now been transferred to the college. This leaves the Bangor Diocese non-residential course as the only part of ordination and Reader training of the Church in Wales which remains outside the St Michael's portfolio, and we would *encourage* the college to explore with Bangor whether this too might appropriately be brought into the same scheme, resourced from a local centre in Gwynedd comparable to the Wrexham centre for the St Asaph diocese. Our soundings in St Asaph

diocese have consistently confirmed that the transfer to St Michael's has led to substantial improvement in the standard of non-residential training, both in the academic curriculum and its delivery and in the administration of the course, as well as in the benefit of enabling candidates from that diocese to have meaningful contact with other ordinands and Reader candidates from across Wales through the residential elements of the course. *We suggest* that similar benefits might accrue for Bangor diocese from involvement in the St Michael's programme.

6 The non-residential programme is currently delivered (apart from centrally organised residential weekends and one residential week a year) at three centres: St Michael's College; Trinity College, Carmarthen; and Glyndwr University, Wrexham. In Carmarthen, which is relatively close to Cardiff, there is no local coordinator employed by St Michael's, but the Wrexham centre is administered by a local tutor who is jointly employed by the diocese (two thirds) and the college (one third), and so is listed as a member of St Michael's staff - and as such embodies two elements otherwise absent from the full-time Cardiff staff, a first-language Welsh-speaker and an ordained woman. Contact is maintained by visits in both directions, but it is perhaps inevitable that the St Asaph tutor feels to some extent isolated, with the planning and decision-making primarily focused in Cardiff. **We urge** the college to ensure that the St Asaph tutor is fully involved in relevant aspects of college planning, rather than informed of decisions already made in Cardiff.

7 All non-residential training is delivered to ordinands and Reader candidates together. This has obvious benefits both in creating a more viable class size and in enabling these different groups to get to know and appreciate each other in preparation for sharing their distinctive ministries within the diocese. (Throughout this report, where non-residential training is mentioned, we recognise that this is training for both ordinands and candidates for Reader ministry.)

#### 8 *Reader training*

The Church in Wales is attempting to raise the profile and standard of training for Reader candidates. The seriousness of this attempt is confirmed by the fact that the five dioceses that have asked the college to provide the training are also making a significant financial commitment. Reader candidates undertake two years of non-residential training leading to the Certificate in Practical Theology. The training includes a regular placement, normally in the student's local church, together with a four-week placement in a nearby church of a different tradition. Throughout their training Reader candidates are encouraged to integrate their academic and practical training and to reflect on their learning experiences.

9 While we commend the above, it became clear to the inspectors that there are some more basic questions to be addressed with regard to Reader ministry, questions which in the first instance need to be addressed by the Church in Wales. Our observation was that even though Reader candidates are in the majority on the non-residential course, the current training for Reader ministry

is essentially a scaled-down version (two years instead of three, leading to Certificate not Diploma) of that for non-stipendiary ordained ministry, and we have heard this noted with disfavour by Reader candidates. We believe that what is lacking is a clearer policy, across the Province, concerning the distinctive ministry of Readers to complement that of the ordained ministry. Once in place such a policy would need to be followed by a set of criteria and a procedure for selecting candidates with the appropriate potential for training as Readers. The college would then be in a position to agree learning outcomes with the dioceses and to recommend a course of training to equip candidates to fulfil the ministry expected of them. It is because a set of learning outcomes has not yet been set, that the portfolio method of reflection has not yet been implemented for Readers.

### **Recommendation 1**

**We recommend that the Dean of Non-Residential Training invite the Church in Wales to clarify the role of Readers within the Province and agree selection criteria which will apply throughout the Province. The college should then formulate learning outcomes appropriate to this understanding of Reader ministry, and subsequently introduce the use of portfolios for Reader training.**

#### 10 Chaplaincy Studies.

At the time of the last inspection the college had already begun to develop a distinctive ministry in the training of chaplains in areas such as the Health Service, the armed forces, prisons, industry and higher education. This initiative has now resulted in the creation of a Centre for Chaplaincy Studies jointly sponsored by the college and the Cardiff University School of Religious and Theological Studies. The Centre is located in the college, and led by the Dean of Chaplaincy Studies. In addition to promoting research into chaplaincy issues (for which it has been awarded a studentship by the Religion and Society Programme of the AHRC/ESRC Research Councils), it offers a non-residential MTh in Chaplaincy Studies (which has currently 35 students, three from North America), has a contract to provide chaplaincy training for the Ministry of Defence, runs induction courses for health-care chaplains (one of which we observed), and accepts invitations to run chaplaincy training courses for other bodies such as for port chaplains under the auspices of the Sailors' Society. Government departments and other agencies are increasingly using the Centre as a consultancy in matters of relating faith to public life. Because of the ecumenical nature of much chaplaincy provision, much of the Centre's work is strongly ecumenical in its emphasis and delivery. At present this Centre is unique in the UK, and offers an important service to a significant and often forgotten aspect of the churches' ministry, and we commend the college for the initiative it has taken. There is potential for this ministry to develop, and the college is currently planning to bid for substantial additional research funding.

11 Ministry Development.

The appointment three years ago of a Dean of Ministry Development jointly by the college (25%) and the Church in Wales (75%) marks a significant step towards integrating pre- and post-ordination training, as envisaged in the Church of England report *Formation for Ministry within a Learning Church: GS 1496* (The 'Hind Report'). In our view St Michael's is closer to implementing for Wales the recommendations of that report than many of the Regional Training Partnerships in England. The relatively close-knit provincial structure of the Church in Wales, together with the existence of a single theological college for the whole Province, significantly facilitates this development. The Dean works closely with the diocesan officers for Continuing Ministerial Education to ensure an integrated programme of learning which leads appropriately from the pre-ordination training into post-ordination training at the curacy stage and on into in-service training in the subsequent stages of ministry, up to and including pre-retirement courses. We observed two residential courses (one for curates, the other for curates and training incumbents together), both involving participants from across the Province, and were impressed by the care with which the programmes were planned and delivered. The whole programme seems to us a commendable example of 'joined-up' thinking and planning. The college has also recently been involved in setting up an innovative course in 'Mission Shaped Ministry' (see below, paragraph 95).

12 A further initiative recently undertaken by the college is the provision of vocation courses for those considering authorised ministry. These have been well attended and there are already some indications of resultant selections for training.

13 As a result of this diversification, the number of 28 residential ordinands quoted above represents only a part of the total number being trained through St Michael's. The total number of students of the college for 2008/9 is 201, made up as follows:

Stipendiary ordinands (C in W, C of E, Methodist)	26
Non-stipendiary ordinands (Church in Wales)	19
Readers in training	31
Lay students on vocations courses	28
Non-ordinand theology degree students	2
Doctoral research students	5
Chaplaincy MTh students	35
Chaplaincy induction courses	55

This figure does not include the considerable number of clergy and Readers attending provincial in-service training events.

14 The Principal has been appointed Ministry Officer for the Church in Wales, and the college is increasingly being called upon to stimulate thinking about future patterns of ministry in the Province, providing material to facilitate discussion in the Bench of Bishops and the Governing Body. While it might be

suggested that this close relationship involves a possible conflict of interests, we consider that this is outweighed by the clear advantages that it offers in terms of 'joined-up thinking' about ministry and training.

- 15 In view of the diversity of the college's operation, the process of inspection was relatively complex. In advance of our residence at St Michael's for the inspection week, we visited the following:

The 2008 Easter School for non-residential students  
The Core Skills residential weekend for non-residential students, May 2008  
A regular evening's teaching at the Wrexham centre  
A regular evening's teaching at the Carmarthen centre  
A regular evening teaching session for non-residential students at St Michael's  
Two residential in-service training courses  
An induction course for health care chaplains  
A student on Sunday placement in two local churches  
Recently ordained former students of the college.

In addition we invited and received written submissions from church leaders with a stake in the college's work (including those representing the Church of England and the Methodist Church). We also saw samples of students' assessed work submitted to us by the college.

- 16 During the inspection week (March 9-13, 2009) we were resident in the college, attended all college worship and a selection of lectures delivered both at Cardiff University and in the college, met with the staff both corporately and individually, attended the AGM of the Common Room and met with the Student Executive Committee, met with the families' group and with non-resident students attending the Wednesday evening session, met with a representative group of placement supervisors and visited a student on placement in Cardiff Prison. We attended a regular meeting of the college's Trustees, and had a meeting beforehand with the Ministry Bishop of the Church in Wales. We also had interviews with the Provincial Secretary of the Church in Wales and with the Head of the School of Religious and Theological Studies of Cardiff University.
- 17 We were accorded every help and consideration by the college, both in hospitality and in cooperation with all aspects of our inspection. The paper-work produced for us in advance of the inspection was exemplary. We would like to pay tribute to the friendly and accommodating atmosphere of the college, and to the willingness of both staff (teaching and administrative) and students to find time to ensure that we received all the information and comment that we sought, and to make us feel welcome as part of a lively and caring community.
- 18 The following report is organised according to the Criteria for Inspections agreed by the Quality in Formation Panel. The Criteria are printed in *italic* type. The inspectors' report is in normal type. Our Recommendations are in

**bold** type. In places we also *encourage*, **urge** or *suggest* matters for the college's consideration, but which fall short of a formal recommendation.

Declaration of interest. The Senior Inspector was for two years (2005-7) employed by St Michael's College as a Part-Time Module Tutor on the non-residential course based in Wrexham.

## **A AIMS, OBJECTIVES AND EVALUATION OF THE INSTITUTION**

*Inspectors will consider to what extent the declared aims and objectives, strategies and policies of the institution correspond to the needs of the Churches, to the institution's own curriculum validation proposals and to the accepted public and legal criteria.*

*A.i The aims and objectives of the institution should be appropriate to the preparation of ordinands for public ministry within the breadth of traditions of the sponsoring church.*

19 The college has drawn up with some care a statement of the core values and of the vision of the college, which is regularly referred to in the college's life as well as in its documentation. The college refers to itself as 'a Christian, Welsh college,' committed to the four core values of community, generous inclusivity, quality offered with integrity, and creativity.

20 The college sets out in its Strategic Plan for 2008-2013 four core key strategic aims of the college, namely:

Ministry training  
Chaplaincy studies  
Research led training and teaching  
Social impact and community engagement.

While clearly the first of these must be the primary concern of this report, we have noted also the importance of the Centre for Chaplaincy Studies in paragraph 10 above. The research element is limited at present by the fact that only two members of staff are qualified to supervise doctoral research, though the Dean of Chaplaincy Studies is about to submit his own doctoral dissertation. All members of the full-time teaching staff are, however, engaged in research and writing, the benefits of which are clearly evident in the teaching they offer. The primary evidence of 'social impact and community engagement' at present is perhaps in the college's making its facilities available for visiting groups (including the NHS, social services, the BBC, local charities and the local civic society) when not needed for the college's own purposes; but we note also the formation of links with different elements in Cardiff society through the placement programme, and a 'Paradise Run' programme supporting the homeless which is enthusiastically supported by the student body. The college also promotes Fair Trade, and has supported an asylum-seeker at risk of deportation. While the increasing breadth of the college's commitments carries a danger that its primary purpose of ordination

training may be diluted, we have seen no evidence that this has happened hitherto.

- 21 The college has drawn up a carefully considered and incisive response to the four Validation Questions. Emphasis is placed on the importance of the college's Welsh context, and in particular its increasingly close relation with the Bishops and Governing Body of the Church in Wales, as a determining factor in the sort of ministry for which it offers training. We wish to comment on this key aspect of the college's role, and on two other matters which are highlighted in the college's response.
- 22 The Welsh context. This is clearly reflected in the college's training programme, especially in the close liaison which is maintained with the six dioceses of the Church in Wales and with the Wales Synod of the Methodist Church. The Principal's role as Ministry Officer for the Church in Wales ensures that training remains relevant to the developing strategy for ministry in the Province. While the college is keen to encourage ordinands from English dioceses to train at St Michael's it is clearly understood that those who choose to do so must accept and value the essentially Welsh orientation of the college, which is indeed an enhancement to their training for ministry within the wider Anglican Communion.
- 23 The college is aware of the need to prepare ministers for a bilingual church, and to meet the specific linguistic requirements of individual dioceses. It makes suitable provision for students to learn Welsh and to improve their Welsh language skills, including a course in liturgical Welsh. We observed a reasonable balance in the use of the Welsh language in worship, though we are aware that the two students whom we understood to be the most fluent in Welsh were among the group leading worship that week. A weekly Welsh language eucharist has been instituted recently in response to student requests. Spiritual support in the Welsh language is currently available through one of the chaplains. There is official provision through the university for those whose first language is Welsh to submit their work in that language, though we found no evidence of this provision being taken up. We commend the efforts being made by staff to learn and use Welsh, but it remains unfortunate that the college does not have a fluent Welsh speaker on the Cardiff-based speaking staff, and it should be a high priority to rectify this at the earliest opportunity. We also note the absence of Welsh in most of the college's documentation and some of its signage; we realise that a fully bilingual policy for documentation would be both costly and cumbersome, but would *encourage* the college to consider where it might be appropriate and possible for more material to appear in Welsh, as has already been done for placement and sermon-assessment forms.
- 24 We would further observe that Welsh culture is broader than simply the issue of language, and that for ministry in Wales it is important to appreciate the wider cultural issues as they affect the life of the community. We note that some members of staff have attended the programme 'Welcome to Wales', previously run by Cytun and soon to be re-introduced, and would *encourage*

the college to arrange for new staff and students from outside Wales to undertake this course or an equivalent.

- 25 Fresh Expressions. The college emphasises that the ministry for which its students are being prepared is likely to involve not only the traditional parochial mode of ministry but also less traditional and more experimental modes, such as are frequently designated by the term 'Fresh Expressions of Church'. This perspective is evidenced by the college's involvement in the 'Mission Shaped Ministry' course (see below paragraph 95). We commend this openness to less familiar styles of ministry (and therefore of training), and we note with appreciation that the most recently appointed member of staff has particular interest and expertise in this area, which we trust will be drawn on for the benefit of both staff and students as they explore this developing aspect of church and ministry. We are pleased to note that some placement opportunities have already been arranged in less conventional church contexts. We **urge** the college to continue to develop this area of training, in particular by increasing the range of placements on offer in non-traditional church settings.
- 26 Range of churchmanship. The college claims with some justification that it is distinctive among Anglican colleges in the UK as an 'all-party' college. This is of course an inevitable consequence of its being the one college designated for all residential candidates from the Church in Wales, but it is also promoted as a virtue in itself, enabling candidates to experience a wide range of spiritual traditions within Anglicanism and Methodism. We heard, however, the comment of some students, particularly those from a more evangelical background, that there is an essentially 'liberal catholic' complexion to the predominant style of worship in the college, and also in the composition of the teaching staff. We were not made aware of any failure on the college's part to give due respect to any tradition in the church, but would **urge** the college to ensure that both in college worship and in any future staff appointments a suitable balance of churchmanship is maintained.
- 27 The college continues (as it must within the present context of the Church in Wales) to train ordinands who do not accept the ordination of women to the priesthood. The support of the college leadership for the ordained ministry of women is however clear and consistent. A clear policy has been drawn up and communicated to the students to enable those who hold a different view to participate appropriately in college worship (see paragraph 69). There have recently been difficult relations within the student body in connection with difference of opinion on this issue, and we are recommending that the college take further steps to enable all members of the college to live together within the diversity which is the present reality of the Church in Wales (see below paragraphs 64-65, and Recommendation 6). It is important that the college provides a good model of living with diversity, which includes explicit engagement with divisive issues. Those now in training for ministry will thus be better equipped to make a positive contribution to the continuing search for appropriate patterns of fellowship in ministry despite theological divergence.

*A.ii There should be evidence that the current, published statements on training policy produced by the various denominational bodies have been suitably integrated into the training programme.*

28 The Principal's position as Ministry Officer of the Church in Wales, and the role of the Dean of Ministry Development in coordinating all provincial in-service training, ensure that the college remains abreast of all published material relating to the policy of the Province. In addition the college has structured its policy on ministerial formation, and the portfolio which forms the central medium for the monitoring of that formation, on the basis of the Learning Outcomes arising out of the Hind Report and set out in *Shaping the Future* (2006), pp. 64-72, and where appropriate on a version of these approved by the Methodist Church. A summary version of these outcomes forms the basis for reports on students' progress given to sponsoring churches, but see below Recommendation 9 for the need for clearer guidance on this from the church authorities.

*A.iii There should be evidence of action taken in response to the previous inspection Report and any follow-up.*

29 The pace of change in the college since 2003 has been relentless, and in the process most of the recommendations of the previous inspection team have either been implemented or have ceased to apply to the college in its new form. A recommendation regarding URC participation in the college has been sidelined by the decision of the URC not to recognise St Michael's for the training of its candidates. The personal tutorial system was reorganised along the lines recommended, but we shall comment below on ways in which it might be further improved. Where specific changes were recommended they have been duly implemented. But in many other ways this is now a very different college from that inspected in 2003.

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion A, Aims, Objectives and Achievements of the Institution.**

## **B RELATIONSHIPS WITH OTHER INSTITUTIONS**

*Inspectors will examine how the institution relates to other educational provision (including any partner university) and to the Churches and secular organisations in its locality, with particular reference to regional groupings of providers of theological education.*

*B.i The terms of academic and validation/accreditation arrangements with universities should be fair and appropriate to an institution offering training and formation for candidates for ordained ministry.*

30 The relationship of both St Michael's College and the South Wales Baptist College with the Collegiate Faculty of Religious and Theological Studies of Cardiff University is more than simply a validating arrangement. Both institutions are integral members of the Faculty, the third member of which is the

School of Religious and Theological Studies, an arrangement which is expressed in a formal 'Faculty Agreement', which was revised in 2005 in the light of the secession of Cardiff University from the University of Wales. The position of head of the Faculty rotates around the heads of the three constituent institutions. All are equally involved in designing, delivering and assessing the academic curriculum, and an appropriate arrangement is in place for reimbursement to the colleges in recognition of the teaching provided by their staff. Roughly one third of the undergraduate teaching in the Faculty is provided by the two colleges, including all the teaching of modules provided specifically for the BTh programme, which has been designed specifically to meet the needs of the two colleges for ministerial training. The colleges admit their own students to the BA and BTh degrees without charge. The Head of the School is a Trustee of St Michael's College.

31 The recent launch of the Centre for Chaplaincy Studies (see paragraph 10 above) as a joint (and jointly funded) initiative of St Michael's College and the School of Religious and Theological Studies is an indication of the healthy working relationship that exists.

32 The School of Religious and Theological Studies is currently undergoing a review within the university, and it is possible that the outcome of this review might affect the working of the Faculty Agreement.

*B.ii The institution should show signs of drawing as much benefit as may be possible from the demands and resources of universities in teaching quality assessment, staff development and the promotion of research.*

33 In view of the nature of the college's integration into the Faculty, all the facilities available to university members of staff are also available to and are used by members of college staff. College staff are included in the Faculty's submissions under the Research Assessment Exercise. One member of staff is currently completing a doctoral degree at the university. One has completed the first module of the Post-Graduate Certificate in University Teaching and Learning and has received accreditation as a Fellow of the Higher Education Academy. The college is able to present and supervise candidates for post-graduate research degrees of the Faculty, though the Faculty Agreement places a cap on the number of such students in place at any one time.

*B.iii There should be evidence of effective engagement with Churches, other faith communities and secular organisations in the locality such as to enhance preparation for public ministry.*

34 St Michael's College is the provincial training college for the Church in Wales - a closer relationship than exists between any English theological college and its regional church authorities.. The Archbishop of Wales is *ex officio* chair of the Trustees, and three other Welsh bishops (including the Ministry Bishop) are Trustees. The Principal of St Michael's is Ministry Officer for the Church in Wales. The college submits an annual report to the Governing Body, which in September 2007 endorsed the recommendation of the Bench of Bishops to retain and develop the college as a training institution for the Church in Wales.

It is currently the policy of the Bench that all Welsh ordinands (except non-residential students in the diocese of Bangor, see above paragraph 5) should train through St Michael's unless there are exceptional circumstances. The Representative Body of the Church in Wales has provided substantial funding to enable the college to meet its annual revenue requirements, and is committed to continue that funding for the next two years. The Representative Body has also loaned money to the college and has agreed to make a large grant to fund necessary capital costs in developing the college. The Representative Body is also represented on the Trustees. The inspectors had the impression of a close and active relationship between the college and the Church in Wales, which, while not uncritical, is healthily supportive of the work of the college, recognising its central importance for the ongoing life and mission of the Church. A proposal, which remains under discussion, for the offices of the Representative Body to be moved to the college site would further facilitate an already mutually supportive relationship between the college and the Church in Wales.

- 35 The Methodist Church is a long-standing partner in the college. One member of staff is employed by the Methodist Church in the joint role of tutor at St Michael's and Director of the Wales Training Network of the Methodist Church. Methodist forms of worship are regularly included in college chapel. In recent years the number of Methodist students at St Michael's has been small (currently one residential and one non-residential), and the recent change in Methodist training policy (see above paragraph 2) means that it is unlikely that residential students will come to St Michael's in the future, but the Methodist Church remains committed to the college as a partner, with a formal memorandum of association and two places on the Trustee body.
- 36 The English House of Bishops recognises St Michael's as an approved college for ordination training. There are currently four ordinands from English dioceses. The constitution requires that one of the Trustees be a Bishop of the Church of England.
- 37 The college's placement programme provides many links with local churches and, in the case of collaborative placements and long summer placements, sometimes outside the immediate area, including some quite imaginative placements overseas. We had the impression that the majority of placements are in traditional Anglican parish settings, and we hope that the college will continue to explore links with less familiar church settings (see above paragraph 25). It should also be possible to increase the range of placements to include more exposure to more secular environments, such as the existing prison, school and hospital placements.

*B.iv The institution should demonstrate commitment to effective partnership with the other providers of theological education in the region.*

- 38 We have noted in paragraph 30 the college's close relationship with the South Wales Baptist College and the School of Religious and Theological Studies in the academic programme. This is a long-standing and fruitful partnership. We observed, however, that there is little interaction between the two colleges

outside the academic programme, though staff sometimes preach in each other's college chapels. Arrangements for occasional shared teaching programmes in pastoral studies have recently been abandoned, and we heard of no regular provision for joint worship or for social interaction. The colleges are separated by a distance of some three miles and, more importantly, by seriously congested traffic at certain times of day. But even if frequent contact outside the university context is therefore impractical, we remain convinced that both colleges would benefit from at least occasional opportunities to interact at both staff and student level.

## **Recommendation 2**

**That St Michael's College and the South Wales Baptist College explore ways of promoting contact between them in areas additional to the university-based teaching programme, for instance by planning joint worship, social events, or discussion of matters of common interest.**

- 39 There are no other comparable providers of theological education in the Cardiff area.

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion B, Relationships with other Institutions.**

## **C GOVERNANCE, MANAGEMENT, CONSTITUTION AND ORGANISATION**

*Inspectors will examine the role of the Governing Body and other bodies in the oversight and administration of the institution, taking particular note of the way decisions are made and implemented at different levels of the institution*

*C.i There should be evidence of effective financial, administrative and management structures that facilitate the stated aims and objectives of the institution.*

- 40 The Board of Trustees is limited to 15 members, of whom only the Chairman, the Archbishop of Wales, belongs *ex officio*, the remainder being co-opted. Co-opted members are required by the constitution to represent a number of interest groups as follows:

Bench of Bishops of the Church in Wales (2 members);  
Church of England House of Bishops (1 member);  
'other churches participating in the life of the college [which currently in practice means the Methodist Church]' (2 members);  
Cardiff University Faculty (1 member).

Employed members of staff of the college are not Trustees, though the Principal attends as of right. This seems to us a suitable body to exercise effective oversight of the college, and the meeting we attended gave good evidence of its efficient and harmonious operation. We noted with concern, however, that only one of the 15 members of the Board (the Secretary) is a

woman, and would **urge** the Board to aim to redress the gender balance as soon as possible. (See Recommendation 13)

41 The Board is currently conducting a review of its operations, and in particular is now supported by advisory groups, each chaired by a Trustee and incorporating staff members and others with relevant expertise, to cover the two areas of Finance and of Estates. It has also agreed a code of conduct for Trustees, Terms of Reference for the Board, and a statement of the roles and responsibilities of Trustees. These have been drawn up in accordance with Charity Commission guidelines. A detailed and carefully considered risk register has just been adopted by the Trustees. In these and all other ways the Board complies with the statutory requirements for a governing body.

42 The management structure of the college has recently been reorganised into five teams. Four of these are each led by a Dean who is line-manager for the other team members. These teams cover respectively the areas of

Residential Studies  
Non-Residential Studies  
Chaplaincy Studies  
Ministry Development.

The fifth team, led (and line-managed) by the Business Manager, is responsible for the business and domestic side of the college. Each team includes the relevant course tutors and administrative staff. A Strategy Team, consisting of the Principal, the four Deans, the Methodist Tutor, the Business Manager and the Finance Officer, meets weekly during term to oversee the work of the college. This structure impresses us as appropriate and efficient.

43 A new Business Manager, appointed in January 2009, brings to the college substantial expertise in administration and finance, and is already making a noticeable difference to the efficiency of the college's operation. One of her more urgent tasks is the preparation of a new Business Plan for the college, which will be essential to securing the funding the college needs from the Representative Body of the Church in Wales (see next paragraph). The inspectors welcome this new appointment, which has the potential to bring substantial benefit to the college.

44 For many years the college has been operating with student numbers below those required for full financial viability. A figure of 40 residential students has been identified as the size of student body required, but this has not been reached and it is unrealistic, given current recruitment to ordained ministry in the Church in Wales, to expect it to be met in the near future. The considerable diversification of the college's operation set out in paragraphs 3-12 above has made substantial contributions to the college's financial viability, but fee income alone has not come near to meeting the college's financial requirements. As a result, the college has been dependent on funding received annually from the Representative Body of the Church in Wales in order to meet its revenue requirements. Such funding is now promised for the next two years. There has been no surplus available to fund capital development,

and the state of the college premises is now such that this work is urgently required. A programme of building improvements has been drawn up, and priorities identified within it (see Recommendation 4). The Representative Body has in principle agreed to fund such works by a one-off grant, but the size of that grant, and therefore the scope of the work which can be carried out, depends on the Business Plan (see paragraph 43) which is due to be presented to the Representative Body in November 2009. Without such expenditure the buildings will become increasingly unsuitable to attract the income from conferences and other lettings which the college needs in order to cover its costs. The financial situation of the college is therefore far from secure, but this is not because of any failure in management of resources. Indeed all that we have seen of financial management in the college inspires confidence. With continued support from the Church in Wales the college will be able to continue in the present situation, but significant further development will depend on at least maintaining and preferably increasing the student enrolment. The college is well aware of this need, and is taking active measures to address it, not least by attempting to lead the Church in stimulating further vocations to ordained ministry.

*C.ii There should be evidence of a structured contribution made by the student body so that it plays an effective role in decision-making processes.*

- 45 The college's current Strategic Plan was drawn up with substantial student involvement. The Chair of the Common Room Executive Committee (see paragraph 143) attends meetings of the Trustees, but in the meeting we attended he played no active part, with the result that the agenda scarcely touched on matters of direct concern to students. We believe that to include a student report as a regular item on the Trustees' agenda would enable the student perspective to be more adequately addressed. Students are also represented on the Catering Committee and the Estates Committee, and there was a student representative on the interview panel for the last staff appointment. The student Chair meets regularly with the Principal to discuss matters of student concern.

### **Recommendation 3**

**We recommend that the college promote a fuller participation of students in the governance and management of the college, in particular by including a regular report from the student representative on the agenda of Trustees' meetings.**

*C.iii There should be evidence that tutorial and administrative staff are able to fulfil their job descriptions both individually and corporately and are resourced to do so.*

- 46 Job descriptions are kept up to date and their performance is monitored through the appraisal system. As in most other small colleges staff find that they have more responsibilities than would be ideal, but we were not aware that any of them found the competing demands unsustainable, and the new

team structure has led to helpful clarification of boundaries and stream-lining of roles. The provision of IT and other equipment seems to be adequate to the needs of the staff, though the better equipment of the teaching rooms for power-point and similar presentations is among the improvements listed for action when funds are available.

*C.iv There should be a well-designed and operative appraisal system for all staff.*

- 47 Annual appraisal is carried out by the appropriate line-managers, and of those line-managers by the Principal. Staff find the system appropriate and helpful. The Principal's appraisal is carried out by the Chair of Trustees. In view of the complexity of the Principal's managerial role as well as his academic, formational and pastoral responsibilities, we *suggest* that his appraisal should be carried out by the Chair of Trustees together with someone with experience of management of a comparable educational institution.

*C.v The training institution should meet the current legal requirements, for example, with regard to Fire prevention, Health and Safety and Child Protection.*

- 48 Documents clearly setting out the college's policy on health and safety, fire safety, child protection, bullying and harassment, disability access, equal opportunities, data protection, discipline, grievances and indeed on a number of related matters pertaining to the working environment are clearly set out in both the Staff Handbook and the student Residential Handbook. These policies are properly adhered to, except where financial stringency has prevented the implementation of the planned adaptation of buildings and equipment. The college has identified these areas in relation especially to fire safety and to disability access, and has given them top priority in the work scheduled to be carried out. We recognise the problems the college faces, but nonetheless wish to underline the urgency of compliance in these areas. See Recommendation 4 below. We would also observe that health and safety issues apply to placements as well as to life in college, and would **urge** the college to ensure that placement supervisors understand the need for health and safety regulations to be duly adhered to.

<p><b>The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion C, Governance, Management, Constitution and Organisation.</b></p>
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

## **D ACCOMMODATION**

*Inspectors will examine the suitability of the accommodation for teaching and residence.*

*D.i The teaching and residential accommodation should be fit for the purpose of enhancing the community and corporate life of the Institution and of facilitating good adult learning.*

- 49 The majority of academic teaching is undertaken at Cardiff University in accommodation designed and fit for its purpose. The disadvantage to this is the time taken in travelling between St Michael's College and Cardiff University, especially during periods of traffic congestion, which impinges significantly on other aspects of college life.
- 50 Teaching accommodation within the college is adequate but basic. Most teaching rooms are, however, inaccessible to those with disability. There is no loop system in any room, though this is hired in if sufficient notice of need is given. No fixed point projection equipment is available which means trailing wires and the attendant health and safety risks, and added work for tutors in carrying equipment from place to place. The provision of such facilities in teaching rooms, together with improvements to heating, lighting and ventilation, have been identified as priorities for capital expenditure as funds become available.
- 51 Teaching accommodation off-site varies. The communal accommodation at Trinity College, Carmarthen, falls short of the ideal, with some health and safety issues raised in regard to safe access to essential facilities. The rooms used at Glyndwr University, Wrexham, are functionally adequate though inevitably 'institutional'.
- 52 Residential accommodation at the college is old-fashioned, without en-suite facilities. Internet access is not generally available in study-bedrooms and some rooms are subject to noise and odours from neighbouring areas. This is particularly so in the cottage accommodation provided for those who remain on site all year round. Students in the main accommodation block are required to clear their rooms out of term time, for use by conference delegates or other visitors. The complete refurbishment of the accommodation block to bring it up to currently accepted standards (and thus also to facilitate conference letting) is included in the capital works the college is seeking funds to undertake.
- 53 Provision is made for families with children in the lease of housing accommodation locally, and by a small dedicated room within the college, play equipment from which is brought into the common room when appropriate.
- 54 Meals are provided under contract by a small, dedicated team. The standard of catering is high and there is generous provision for those with special nutritional needs. Unusually in a residential institution we heard nothing but praise for the standard of catering and the spirit in which it is provided. For residential students who are out at the university all day, a packed lunch is provided. Families of students are encouraged to be part of the communal dining one evening each week, and one lunch and one dinner is without charge. Part-time students are present mainly on a Wednesday evening. During the week of the inspection the ageing oven, which was scheduled for replacement, broke down, but good meals were still provided. Within the plans for refurbishment are the removal of the serving area from the dining room back into the adjoining room, thus freeing up additional seating space and allowing a better flow of 'customers'. There is also a proposed scheme to

introduce meal vouchers for visitors to the college (not for students), to help with controlling costs and preventing food wastage. Small kitchen areas with basic equipment are provided on each floor of the accommodation block, but are not greatly used.

- 55 At weekends and out of term the college is very quiet. Diversification to offer Sunday lunch for the local community is now developing into a wider service as a venue for afternoon teas and small parties. Conference bookings also make use of the larger college rooms for buffet-style refreshment. The concern amongst the student body is that the core purpose of the college becomes obscured and their needs for common room space are not recognised (see paragraph 64 below). This tension highlights the changing nature of theological education provision whereby residential students can no longer be considered as 'more important' than those who have alternative training patterns, and where their numbers alone cannot support financial viability.

*D.ii There should be an awareness of perceived inadequacies, and a policy and programme for addressing them.*

- 56 St Michael's College is in the process of formulating a business plan to address the recognised inadequacies in its teaching, residential and catering accommodation. It has subjected itself to critical review and has submitted a request to the Church in Wales Representative Body (see paragraphs 34 and 44) for a capital grant for this purpose. This request includes an early draw-down of funding to enable urgent work to meet statutory and safety requirements, which have been clearly identified, and which are not optional.

#### **Recommendation 4**

**We recommend that the works already identified as essential to meet statutory requirements for safety and disability access be carried out without delay.**

**The inspection team has confidence with qualifications with regard to Criterion D, Accommodation.**

## **E COMMUNITY AND CORPORATE LIFE**

*Inspectors will consider how the institution understands and structures community life, and interprets the role of corporate life in training for ordained ministry; also how far corporate life is evident in the relationships between members of the institution.*

- E.i The institution should offer a clear statement of how it understands its corporate life, including issues of gender, ethnic grouping and disability and other matters of natural justice, in a way which harmonises with its aims and objectives in preparing candidates for public ministry.*

- 57 We have noted in paragraph 19 the core values and vision identified by the college. These are printed prominently at the beginning of the Residential Handbook and the New Student Handbook (for non-residential students). The core values are more fully spelled out as follows:

Community (which is built on respect for people and a valuing of diversity);  
Generous inclusivity (extended ecumenically, in inter-faith dialogue and more widely);  
Quality offered with integrity (to all who are part of or have dealings with the College);  
Creativity (which the College not only values but works to stimulate).

The statement of the college's vision includes concepts which relate to community and corporate life such as being 'hospitable and welcoming' and 'people-centred'.

- 58 While there is thus a clear commitment to diversity and inclusivity as principles, we found no statements relating them explicitly to gender or ethnicity. The issue of diversity occurs elsewhere in the Handbooks in an ecclesiological context relating to different Christian traditions. Gender and ethnicity are explicitly dealt with only as part of the Discrimination policies and are thus presented in the context of freedom from discrimination, rather than as positive gifts to the community. We *suggest* that the college consider broadening its statements relating to matters of natural justice in the light of these comments.

*E.ii The institution should show evidence that the structures, requirements and practice of the institution reflect the stated policy.*

- 59 The college values its identity as an 'all-party college' offering a very special formational context. As the only residential training institution for the Church in Wales, the college brings students from varying traditions together in close proximity. This situation has creative potential for ministerial formation, and we found this potential both well recognised and in many ways helpfully exploited in the college's life. But, while recent events around one particular student (who has since left the college) may have given undue and unhelpful prominence to differences of tradition, we also noted other aspects of the college's life where there may be a need for further affirmation of the core value of 'respect for people and a valuing of diversity'.
- 60 The staffing structure of the college can be perceived as embodying an unhelpful gender balance, in that all the teaching staff are male and all the administrative staff and nearly all the domestic staff female. The two part-time female pastoral tutors are perceived by some students as being in a subordinate role because they do not teach and are not always in the communication 'loop', while the fact that they share office space is not helpful to their pastoral work. We shall comment below on the need for the college to appoint a woman to the teaching staff, recognising their clear intention to do so when possible; see below paragraph 133 and Recommendation 13.

- 61 There was no black or ethnic minority representation among either staff or students at the time of the inspection, though we understand that there have been a number of such students in recent years. The college does, however, have a special opportunity to explore issues of cultural and racial awareness, as a Welsh institution which welcomes students and staff from other parts of the United Kingdom as well as from overseas.
- 62 The difficulties of disability access were demonstrated during our stay when a student broke a bone in her foot on the college premises and was on crutches. We recognise that these issues are being addressed, subject to financial constraints.
- 63 The families' group functions as a significant place of support and friendship for those able to attend. We wondered, however, whether there was sufficient opportunity for spouses to be integrated with the student body. We *suggest* that the college consider reconfiguring the group's activities to provide a nucleus for more structured reflection on preparation for life alongside ordained ministry. Students might also be invited to consider how spouses and families may be better included in the common life with this aim in view.
- 64 Little use appears to be made of the student common room at present. This is partly because the room is sometimes taken over by visiting groups, so that students feel that it is not respected as 'their' room. But some students also spoke of deliberately avoiding the common room because of the behaviour of others. We heard evidence that the differences within the college over the ordination of women have at times led to bad-mannered and inappropriate behaviour. While this is in part attributable to the recent tensions referred to in paragraph 59, we felt that the problem had not yet been fully resolved. Learning to live appropriately with those who hold strongly opposing views is part of training for ministry in today's churches, and we believe there is still room for improvement here.
- 65 Having been made aware of such tensions within the college community, we make the recommendation below in the belief that external facilitation can help to bring about a greater level of trust and more open conversation within the community. We would *encourage* the college to work on a theological articulation of its laudable commitment to being a hospitable, welcoming, inclusive and diverse community. We observed an inspiring teaching session on the theology of Michael Ramsey, which offered the concept of community as a place of transfiguration and transformation: might this provide an organising principle for the college to reflect and work on its community and corporate life?

### **Recommendation 5**

**We recommend that early in the next academic year, after allowing for an initial settling-in period, the college engage external consultants to facilitate an opportunity for the whole residential community to work on issues of living together in diversity, and that the need for such a session in future years be kept under review.**

**The inspection team has confidence with qualifications with regard to Criterion E, Community and Corporate Life.**

## **F COMMON WORSHIP**

*Inspectors will consider the arrangements for common worship and the policy underlying them, noting the use of the authorised and other forms of worship, and how worship is conducted.*

*F.i The spaces designated for prayer and worship should be appropriate for their purpose.*

66 The college chapel, an impressive listed building, is one of the college's main assets. It is set apart for worship and is used several times a day. The pews are rather high but they are moveable and are sometimes reconfigured for acts of worship. The focal point is a large hanging of Christ seated in glory, set away from the east wall. Also on the east wall there is an area, off centre, onto which images and words are sometime projected as an aid to worship. The interior needs a coat of paint, and attention is required to an area of damp in the ceiling, both of which we understand are on a schedule of work to be done in due course. We were sorry (though we understand the security problems) to find that the chapel is kept locked when not in use for services, though students have access to a key.

67 Worship at the weekly sessions for non-residential students in Carmarthen takes place in the Trinity College chapel. At Wrexham it has to be in the classrooms; this is not an ideal situation, but it is not easy to see how it can be avoided in the light of the limited range of rooms available to the course at Glyndwr University.

*F.ii There should be a publicly stated policy on, and arrangements for, corporate worship. The policy and arrangements should take account of, and equip candidates to work within, the variety of practice within the sponsoring church.*

68 The policy for worship in college chapel is currently expressed in the 'Worship Handbook 2008/9'. The weekly pattern of worship includes variety and the opportunity for experimental worship. The variety includes liturgies from the Church in Wales, the Church of England and the Methodist Church. We were not sure that the significant amount of time devoted to the Church of England Common Worship was appropriate to a Welsh college, particularly as this restricts the scope for bilingual worship. We would **urge** the college to re-examine the allocation of time to the various liturgies so as to ensure an adequate coverage of Welsh liturgy (including the 1984 Book of Common Prayer which is still widely used in Welsh parishes but does not feature in the college's eucharistic worship) without neglecting the use of the Church of England liturgy and the 1662 Book of Common Prayer (which is used for one week in the year).

69 An appropriate policy for eucharistic participation is laid out in the Worship Handbook, in which the college recognises the decision of the Church in Wales to ordain women to the priesthood, yet seeks to respect the conscience of those who cannot accept the eucharistic presidency of women, non-Anglican clergy or both. We would *encourage* the whole community to follow this policy. Our conversations with students gave the impression that the consciences of those students opposed to the ordination of women were on occasions not fully respected.

*F.iii There should be a policy concerning balance of worship, including authorised and innovative forms, and of denominational worship in ecumenical situations.*

70 The policy includes a balance of authorised and the possibility of innovative forms of worship. We experienced authorised liturgical worship, some of which was led extremely well with an excellent contribution from the choir. On other occasions the liturgical services were not so well led and lacked the use of imagination within the structure. The weekly family Eucharist enabled families to worship together as part of the student body, and is to be commended both for its inclusivity in worship and as a preparation for coping with the messiness of all-age worship in parish life.

71 We did not experience worship drawn from other denominations during inspection week. The policy indicates that there is Methodist worship at several points during the year. The residential courses for the non-residential students also include a due proportion of Methodist worship, and the Healthcare Chaplaincy Course we visited included worship from a variety of traditions (even including a Muslim contribution). We believe that occasional joint worship with the Baptist College, which we have recommended (Recommendation 2), would provide a further valuable opportunity to experience worship in a different denominational style.

*F.iv In the light of preparation for public ministry, there should be provision to address the tension between worship as an activity of the Church and as a vehicle of professional training.*

72 A paragraph in the Worship Handbook recognises the tension between worship, in itself, and the need for training in leading worship. Students are expected to request at least five pieces of feedback on how they lead worship during each year of training. This can take place in relation to either college worship or worship led during placement. The aim of this policy is that students should not always feel under scrutiny when leading worship in chapel.

73 The one area of worship of which the inspectors were particularly critical was the worship in tutorial groups that currently take place on Tuesday afternoons. The theory is that this is an opportunity for more experimental worship in a smaller group (10 students and 2 tutors) in an informal setting. The time in the group after worship can be used for discussion of an aspect or styles of worship or it may be used for planning future chapel worship to be led by the

group or for discussion on other issues affecting the life of the college. Our observation was that in one of the groups the worship was well planned and imaginative but in the other two groups it was uninspiring and not carefully planned, and that the groups lacked clear leadership. See below paragraph 84 and Recommendation 6 for our recommendations on rethinking these groups and their worship.

*F.v There should be a policy about expected attendance at public worship and evidence of its outworking.*

- 74 Policy for public worship beyond the college is only laid down with regard to placements. Residential and non-residential ordinands and Reader candidates are all expected to spend fifteen Sundays per year in their placement church, which will include worship.
- 75 There is a stated policy about expected attendance at college worship for both residential and non-residential students. Residential Anglican ordinands are expected to attend two acts of worship each day. Morning prayer is said in chapel each day and Anglican ordinands are encouraged to develop this regular pattern of prayer. There is no regular evening office, but as the college is close to the cathedral, we *suggest* that the Worship Handbook might highlight the possibility of students attending the evening office in the cathedral - though we recognise that this would require some adjustment to the time of dinner. Five acts of worship during the week (plus attendance at chapel practice on Monday afternoons) are designated as obligatory for all residential Anglican ordinands. We *suggest* that the Worship Handbook be revised to clarify how this relates to the 'expectation' of attendance twice daily. For Methodist students a weekly pattern of attendance is agreed with the Methodist tutor.
- 76 Non-residential students at Carmarthen and Wrexham begin their weekly sessions with worship. The nature and quality of this worship, which is normally student-led, is somewhat variable, but it is taken seriously as a part of the course commitment. Those studying at Cardiff on Wednesday evenings join the resident community for the college Eucharist at 5.00pm, though some find it difficult or impossible to get to the college by that time owing to employment commitment or traffic congestion at that time of day. Worship is integral to the residential aspects of non-residential training, within which a suitable range of liturgies and styles of worship is maintained.
- 77 The evidence for the outworking of the above policy was more difficult to assess. Students are expected to take responsibility for their own spiritual development so there is no strict monitoring of chapel attendance. Personal tutors of resident students say that they become aware if students are regularly missing from chapel. However personal tutors are not always present for worship. This may be because they are part-time or have responsibilities away from the college. We were told of instances when students had been missing from worship for some considerable time before the staff or personal tutor intervened. We **urge** the college to ensure that

chapel attendance is properly monitored and that all students fulfil the college's expectations in this regard (see also Recommendation 7(i)).

- 78 We believe that, within the constraints of their recognised commitments, it is important for staff to model the standard of worship attendance that is expected of students. We also *suggest* that personal tutors may need to be more pro-active in discussing with students their discipline of public worship.

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion F, Common Worship.**

## **G MINISTERIAL, PERSONAL AND SPIRITUAL FORMATION**

*Inspectors will consider how the institution helps candidates in their ministerial, personal and spiritual formation, and how candidates are encouraged or enabled to deepen their spiritual life and their self-awareness.*

*G.i The policy regarding ministerial formation should be easily available to the candidates.*

- 79 The policies are contained in a number of clear and well presented booklets including the Formation for Ministry Handbook, Placement Handbooks for residential and non residential ordinands and Readers, the Core Skills for Ministry Handbook, handbooks for the Ministerial Formation Portfolio and the Collaborative Ministry Placement Handbook.

*G.ii The institution through its common life and through the way it guides and supervises candidates should enable them to grow in Christian discipleship with a view to exercising a public role in ordained ministry*

- 80 The college stresses the importance of its community life as a means of supporting students and their families during training. Formation for ministry is provided in a number of ways. The college has a tutorial system with students allocated to different tutors, and a tutorial group system whereby tutors and students gather for worship and reflection and discussion. There is a wide-ranging placement scheme. The Core Skills for Ministry programme is offered over two years for residential ordinands and for Reader candidates, and over three for non-residential ordinands; it covers topics such as leading worship and preaching, leading small groups, mission, pastoral care, leadership, building community, and the Leavers' Course and includes wider issues of ecumenism and multi-faith relationships. Students at the college and former students who are ordained spoke highly of the Core Skills programme and the tools it gave them as they embarked on ordained ministry.

*G.iii The institution should enable candidates to be immersed in the traditions of their own churches, together with an empathetic understanding of strands other than their own. It should also increase candidates' understanding of the tradition of other churches and deepen their sense of their ecclesial identity*

81 The college through its staff and student bodies, and in its commitment to ecumenical training, represents a wide range of traditions within Anglicanism and Methodism. An earlier recommendation regarding the development of the relationship with the Baptist College (Recommendation 2) if implemented will further develop this experience. A key element in furthering this experience is offered through the placements as part of the ministerial formation courses. A variety of placements are required for all residential and non-residential candidates in training. Full details of what is expected, assessment and the process of reflection on these placements are provided in the Placement Handbooks and Core Skills Handbooks. A weekly placement (15 Sundays and 15 half days) in a local church or parish is required for all students during which they will preach and lead worship as well as experience other areas of ministry. We found some unease among supervisors as to the compatibility of the placement requirements with the student timetable, and in particular the problem of how to make constructive use of a weekly half-day visit.

82 A long summer placement is required for full time ordinands to give further experience of day-to-day ministry. There is also a collaborative ministry project for full-time ordinands and Methodist student ministers, with the emphasis on working with other people and reflecting on that experience. This was felt to be an important initiative which should deepen a student's understanding of the context and practice of collaborative ministry. Feedback from supervisors and tutors from the college is part of the process of assessment, as is also the requirement for students to reflect and report on their placements. Placement supervisors spoke positively of the placement system and the support given to them and the students during these placements. Any problems were dealt with pastorally and efficiently. The choice of placements is discussed with students, particularly in the second and third year, and some students play a significant part in identifying and organising their placements. Often this works well, but we would **urge** the college to exercise a greater degree of direction in the allocation of placements in the light of individual students' training needs, and also so as to ensure equality of opportunity between residential and non-residential candidates. In particular we note the importance of identifying placements which will broaden students' experience of ecumenical and pioneer ministry contexts.

*G.iv The institution should provide corporate and individual guidance and supervision for candidates. There should also be encouragement to seek confidential spiritual counsel.*

83 Individual guidance and support is provided by the personal tutors for residential and non-residential students. As well as the full-time academic staff, there is further support from two part-time tutors for residential students, and additional tutorial support for non-residential students. Residential and non-residential Methodist students have tutorial support from the oversight tutor appointed by the Conference for the Wales Training Network. The Formation for Ministry Handbook states that students should meet formally with their personal tutors at least at the beginning and end of each term. Overall this

works well and some students meet more often than that, but we heard of instances where the minimum requirement is not being met and this needs to be addressed to ensure that support and supervision are provided and that any issues which might be emerging in the lives of students are dealt with early on. It is also important that tutors model the life and discipline which students are expected to live, and while not all tutors are able to be present because of the demands of their particular posts, tutors should wherever possible be present at all worship and be seen to participate as fully as possible in the whole life of the college, thus enabling easy contact with the students and an ongoing awareness of any difficulties or tensions.

- 84 Apart from group work and lectures the college provides for a system of tutorial groups for residential students. Three such groups meet weekly, each consisting of two tutors plus their tutees. Potentially these groups should be an important support for the students. The Formation for Ministry Handbook says that these can, in addition to worshipping, and planning for group-led worship for the college twice a term, 'be used to share faith journeys, explore particular topics together and provide mutual support and encouragement'. To fulfil these aims relationships within these groups need to develop to allow for trust, respect and confidentiality to be accepted by all present. The groups are perhaps too large, and do not appear to have enabled students to develop the relationships which would release the potential of the groups. They appeared to us to lack leadership from either a designated student or one of the tutors. Many students appeared not to engage with the exercise and some told us later they felt it was a waste of time. Further, the staff of the college operate a policy of 'corporate confidentiality', accepted by the students and detailed in the Formation for Ministry Handbook, which means that information shared with a member of staff can be shared with the other staff. The presence of staff acting under this policy will inevitably limit the freedom with which students can talk about issues affecting them. We believe that the boundaries of confidentiality as well as the structure and aims of these groups need to be re-examined.

### **Recommendation 6**

**We recommend that the college review the aims and effectiveness of tutorial group meetings, with particular attention to**

- (i) providing a more structured environment for interaction and constructive reflection and feedback in a 'safe' environment;**
- (ii) promoting creative but critical analysis of the principles of worship, especially in a group context.**

- 85 The college has four chaplains to provide independent, confidential advice and spiritual support for students. Only one of these chaplains appears to attend college on a weekly basis and to take a part in the worshipping life of the college, alternating with other staff in celebrating the Welsh language eucharist, and while others might offer support in other ways, it is important that the chaplains are seen in college and in regular contact with the students.

86 The Formation for Ministry Handbook encourages students to find spiritual directors outside the college and, since the Diocese of Llandaff has compiled a list of experienced spiritual directors, offers a contact for such information. Personal tutors continue to encourage students to make use of such support. It is important that spiritual directors are completely independent of the college and are not involved in any other area of a student's training. Some concern was expressed that on at least one occasion a placement supervisor was also the placement student's spiritual director.

### **Recommendation 7**

**We recommend that the college strengthen the role of pastoral care of students by ensuring that:**

- (i) personal tutors are regularly available in college and present at college worship whenever possible;**
- (ii) all students have regular meetings with tutors according to the college's guidelines;**
- (iii) chaplains are regularly present in college, and are available to provide confidential support as needed;**
- (iv) students are encouraged to find spiritual directors who take no other part in any area of their training.**

*G.v The institution should enable candidates to reflect on the breadth of Christian spiritual tradition and its engagement with the world, and to work with the personal issues arising out of the whole process of training.*

87 The college draws students from a wide range of traditions within Anglicanism as well as Methodism and, potentially, other denominations. In addition, students may opt to take university courses on the history of spirituality, an introduction to spirituality and spiritual nurture and guidance. We were able to attend some of these lectures, which were well taught and are well received by the students. Elements in the Core Skills programme encourage students to look beyond their own particular tradition and vision of the Church. The importance of being able to reflect on their experiences, their understanding of the mission and ministry which will be entrusted to them, and on their own personal development, is highlighted throughout training and is an important tool in the formation process.

88 In addition to the personal tutors, the tutorial groups and the placements, students are encouraged to keep a portfolio bringing together details and reflections on the life experience that the student brings with them, the journey through selection and training and into their Initial CME and their first post of responsibility. Written guidance on compiling the portfolio is provided through two handbooks, one introducing the process and explaining the rationale, the second a practical handbook on developing the portfolio and clearly indicating the learning outcomes (see paragraph 29) expected at each stage of a student's experience. Students are encouraged to write a number of reflections as they go through the process, and to include in their portfolio a wide

range of material to evidence their experiences and development during training and to show that the learning outcomes are being achieved. The portfolio is presented every year to the tutor in readiness for the preparation of end-of-year reports. The portfolio scheme is a valuable and impressive contribution to the formation process, enabling students to trace a consistent line of development in pre- and post-ordination training. There is a clear expectation that the work on the portfolio continues into ordained ministry. Clearly some students find the process of reflection, certainly written reflection, easier than others, but the evidence is that this is an important development in the training offered and a significant tool in the student's formation.

*G.vi The institution should enable candidates to develop as people, as future public ministers and as life-long learners, able to look forward to working effectively in the context of traditions other than their own, both within and beyond their own church.*

- 89 The importance of experience and reflection in developing the students as future public ministers and as life-long learners is clearly appreciated by the college and its commitment to this, within the framework of the Learning Outcomes as expressed in the portfolio and reflection process, is commendable. Its strong links with the Church in Wales enable the college to work as a provider of ICME and to work closely with the officers of the dioceses to ensure an integrated policy and programme of training. As part of this the college recognises the importance of increasing the students' experience and understanding of collaborative ministry as evidenced in the Collaborative Ministry Handbook and placement. It is important that the study and experience of collaborative ministry is developed and reflected on throughout the course of a student's time in college so that students understand the theology, significance and value of collaborative ministry in a wide range of contexts.

### **Recommendation 8**

**We recommend that the college give further attention to enabling both ordinands and trainee Readers to understand the theology, theory and practice of ministry teams and collaborative ministry.**

- 90 The staff through their commitment to ongoing professional development and study present a good model to the students of the importance of life-long learning.
- 91 Annual reports on all students are sent to the relevant church authorities. It is important that these reports reflect the requirements of the relevant authorities both in judging a person's suitability for ordained ministry and in working on their placement and continuing development in the early years of ordained ministry. This requires not only the input of the students and their insights on their development, but also an objective reflection by the relevant staff on the student's readiness for ordained ministry. It is important that the college and the relevant authorities have a clear understanding of what is required in the reports and in what detail that information should be provided.

## Recommendation 9

**We recommend that the college seek a clear understanding of what the relevant church authorities require in the annual reports on students, and that such reports be detailed and objective.**

*G.vii Candidates should be encouraged to make time for private prayer and to explore the expectations on the ordained in the areas of corporate and individual prayer, of general conduct and of lifestyle.*

- 92 The Worship Handbook emphasises the importance not only of the worship of the community but also of the commitment to personal times of prayer. We became aware, however, that the requirements of ministerial formation, particularly in terms of personal prayer, time for reflection and study, preaching requirements and church placements, as well as the demands of the university and college courses, constitute a heavy work load, which can erode the essential time for family and personal life. It is important that the College looks carefully at the demands placed on a student's life to ensure a work/life balance which will support them in their future ministry.

## Recommendation 10

**We recommend that the college regularly review the relationship between the requirements of the academic curriculum and of the courses relating to pastoral formation, to ensure an appropriate balance, with adequate time for prayer and reflection and, importantly, for the students' family and personal life, thus modelling an appropriate work/life balance for their future ministry.**

**The inspection team has confidence with qualifications with regard to Criterion G, Ministerial, Personal and Spiritual Formation**

## H TEACHING AND LEARNING: CONTENT, METHOD AND RESOURCES

*Inspectors will attend a representative sample of different teaching and learning activities, noting their quality and effectiveness and the methods used. They will examine the adequacy of educational resources, especially libraries, and will look at samples of students' written work.*

*H.i The content and process of the educational programmes should equip candidates for beginning public ministry, in line with denominational guidelines.*

- 93 Learning outcome statements based on *Shaping the Future* are clearly presented and serve as an integrating framework for formation during initial ministerial education (IME). The Methodist Church uses the same outcome statements but grouped under different headings; this version of the outcomes

is used in the Formation for Ministry Handbook and is also available for Methodist students compiling Portfolios.

*H.ii Principles concerning what is included in pre-ordination/authorisation training and left to post-ordination/authorisation training should be available and consonant with any denominational requirements.*

94 Because the college now provides, in consultation with diocesan CME officers, for almost all provincial in-service training for the Church in Wales (see paragraph 11), including role-specific training, it is able to complement the pre-ordination/ministerial training in an integrated programme. Methodist training programmes are individually negotiated in order to conform to denominational requirements. The portfolio system of assessment is designed to form a continuous record throughout ministry as well as before ordination, informing the student/minister of areas of growth and helping them to address perceived deficiencies.

95 St Michael's, the Methodist Church, the Diocese of Llandaff and the Diocese of Monmouth have worked in partnership to offer the 'Mission Shaped Ministry' Course. This will see parish teams of clergy and laity working together to explore fresh expressions of church and pioneer ministry. The inspection team welcomes this initiative and looks forward to students/ministers being able to learn from and develop collaborative and mission-shaped working in their own contexts.

*H.iii Teaching and learning programmes should serve the aims and objectives of the institution and of the educational programmes of which they form a part. They should demonstrate a proper balance between the academic, formational and practical aspects of training.*

96 Academic standards are high within all areas of the college's teaching provision. The rigorous academic standard maintained in the part-time course as much as in the full-time course means, however, that part-time students in particular experience considerable pressure in workload and the proper balance between the academic, formational and practical aspects of training is hard to maintain (see above paragraph 92 and Recommendation 10).

97 For full-time students the tutorial system is meant to provide opportunity for reflection and consideration of the connections between the theology experienced in academic learning and the theology of daily life and interaction. See, however, our critical comments on the functioning of the tutorial groups in paragraph 84, and Recommendation 6.

98 The team structure (outlined in paragraphs 3 and 42) has strengthened focus on delivery outcomes. Co-ordination and communication between teams has been helped by the structured liaison now co-ordinated by the Business Manager. Three times each year the Strategy Team meets with an outside consultant to examine and strengthen structures and relationships.

*H.iv Units of teaching and learning should have clear and appropriate aims, be well structured and enable students to achieve appropriate learning goals. Teaching programmes should introduce students to the appropriate knowledge and learning processes, while drawing on student experience.*

- 99 There is enormous diversity in provision at St Michael's but a clearly stated aim that 'there is discernibly comparable student experience in taught modules for those on a full-time course and part-time students'. Academic teaching and learning is done in partnership with the South Wales Baptist College and with The School of Religious and Theological Studies (RELIG). For those who are studying full-time there is the option to study in a more academic scheme for a BA degree. This is usually the option chosen by students who wish to gain some expertise in biblical languages. A more vocationally focussed degree course has been developed for the BTh degree, although modules may overlap between these two degree pathways. The emphasis of the BTh is on independent learning in a research-led environment, which encourages a close correlation between teaching and pastoral practice. The BTh is the programme followed by most ordinands.
- 100 Modules from the BTh programme are also offered over a period of two or three years for mature students, generally but not exclusively graduates in disciplines other than theology, training part-time, to obtain a Diploma in Practical Theology or Certificate in Practical Theology. This teaching takes place at St Michael's, and at two outreach locations: at Trinity College, Carmarthen and at Glyndwr University, Wrexham.
- 101 For students who already hold a theology degree there are opportunities to study for the MTh in Practical Theology, Christian Ethics, Christian Doctrine or Church History, or to be supervised for a research degree (MPhil/PhD). This provision offers a suitable context for developing those who are identified as possible future theological educators.
- 102 The Chaplaincy Centre (see paragraph 10) has established a strong MTh programme, giving St Michael's a national and international reputation. Good networking of chaplains and their organisations is leading to further requests for consultancy and training. The chaplaincy programme, although a strategic aspect of the development of St Michael's, does not yet contribute significantly to the general ministerial training. In making chaplaincy a key aspect of training, St Michael's leads the way in exploring the interface between theological thinking and public policy. It also provides a context for interfaith exploration and dialogue which enriches the learning experience as a whole.

### **Recommendation 11**

**We recommend that the college seek ways of incorporating appropriate insights developed in the Centre for Chaplaincy Studies into the general ministerial training, particularly as it relates to exploring the interface between theology and public life.**

- 103 The Core Skills programme (see paragraph 81) is not an academic course. It builds upon the existing experience of students and that gained during placements to reflect and develop good practice. In the light of developments in forms of ministry in the wider church, the college should give special priority to the Learning Outcome which involves collaborative leadership and ability to work in teams, especially by making wider provision for placement experience in situations which involve working in ministerial teams (see Recommendation 8).

*H.v The educational methods employed, and the balance of methods within the educational programme, should underpin the stated aims of the programme.*

- 104 Educational methods are healthily varied, including lecture, seminar presentation and participation, individual preparation through reading, research and production of presentation, essay and project work. Church and secular placements provide opportunity for practical learning and some peer review.

- 105 Reflection through portfolio has been introduced in the last two years (see paragraph 88) and, although still in its infancy in implementation, is proving a useful tool for encouraging self-assessment and reflective practice. Introductory reading lists and the induction weekend have been important elements in guiding the focus of non-residential students in method and expectation.

104. The ASQC (Academic Standards and Quality Committee) requested three years ago an annual report monitoring the teaching provision for the Certificate and Diploma for part-time students in teaching centres outside Cardiff. This was to be expected, as apart from the provision at the University Hospital Medical School, this is the only university award taught in outreach form. In the third of these annual reports, this academic year, the professional development of part-time teaching staff is seen to have been thoroughly reviewed. Plans are in formation for an intensive residential conference to ensure the proper level of training for part-time tutors, attendance at which will be mandatory. The ASQC proposed the adoption of PRLT (Peer Review of Learning and Teaching) to aid more focused evaluation and applied tutor training, particularly for those who work in locations away from Cardiff. Previously it had been felt that peer-review within small group work so altered the dynamic of the group that its usefulness was severely limited. The college has worked with the university to provide non-observation options in training which concentrate on different learning styles and the adaptation of teaching style to match context and learner-type, recommending VAK (visual, auditory and kinaesthetic) as a simple model. There has also been a more intensive approach to student evaluation, involving frequent student feedback. PRLT will continue to be explored through some periodic peer-review of class teaching, and by adoption of a more collaborative approach to planning and assessment, and the Dean of Non-residential Training continues to keep in close contact with tutors throughout the year. The non-residential teaching sessions attended by inspectors indicated that there is still a wide range of expertise and of effectiveness amongst the part-time tutors. We therefore welcome the prospect of more stringent quality control and the opportunities

now being provided for improving tutors' skills in teaching and assessment. We would **urge** the college to ensure that a high standard of teaching is maintained across all modules, and that, where appropriate, training in adult education methods is encouraged.

*H.vi Teaching programmes should be complemented by structured opportunities for students to learn, as individuals and as groups.*

- 107 Seminar presentation and interaction is integral to the learning method. There was evidence of good engagement with local experience in both church and society generally. There has been some concern that the small numbers of students studying for the third year of the Diploma may inhibit class discussion, but this has been partially mitigated by closer interaction with the teacher.

*H.vii Staff should provide formal and informal feedback to students and assessment of work and of candidates' progress, both in terms of academic progress and in terms of preparation for beginning public ministry. There should be both affirmation and constructive criticism, as appropriate, of students and of work.*

- 108 Assessment of students through formative and summative marking is monitored both internally and externally. At present feedback is given to students at the formative stage of assessment, but university policy inhibits the provision of feedback at the summative stage, though this can be provided informally if specifically requested by the student. We believe that the lack of regular feedback at the summative stage is both unsatisfying for the student and also represents a lost opportunity to enhance the student's learning.

## **Recommendation 12**

**We recommend that both colleges work with the School of Religious and Theological Studies to ensure that students receive adequate feedback on their assessed work both formative and summative.**

- 109 The college's statement of Core Values includes the vision of being 'Rooted in and living a broad understanding of Christian mission, involving dialogue that goes beyond conversation'. While this principle is stated primarily with reference to the wider community, it has also an appropriate bearing on the learning process within the college. The inspection team found limited evidence of such dialogue in either formal or informal feedback on written work: in examples of essays we saw there was a greater emphasis on noting incorrect grammar and sentence structure than on challenging inappropriate and unsubstantiated opinion. In an ICME residential for curates and their training incumbents good material was presented but we felt there was a lack of incisiveness and challenge in assimilating it. In the tutorial group meetings (see above paragraph 84) the inspection team similarly noted a lack of clear leadership and guidance in how to address issues that are contentious. The inspection team felt that the gift of being an 'all-party' college could be more creatively explored and used as an opportunity for modelling future ministry

within an 'all-party' church. These are a few examples of areas where we feel that the college needs to work harder at living up to its stated aim within its own structures and programme, and we **urge** the college to re-assess how 'dialogue which is more than conversation' can be facilitated and incorporated as integral to the learning experience.

- 110 We have commented with enthusiasm on the college's introduction of a portfolio system, now in its second year (see paragraph 88). We found, however, that for some students portfolio work is not integrated into their normal pattern of study and reflection, and is perceived rather as an additional burden, seeming to some to involve as much work as an additional module. There seems as yet to be no common understanding of how much to include within a portfolio or how to make the best use of the opportunity for reflection that it offers. Journaling is also strongly recommended by the college and some students prefer to keep more personal reflections in their journal rather than in the more public arena of the portfolio. We **urge** the college to give more support and guidance in preparation and use of the portfolio system.

*H.viii Published assessment criteria should be used by the teaching staff and be available to students.*

- 111 Work is assessed according to four criteria: knowledge, analysis, argumentation and presentation (known by the acronym KAAP). The marking scales applied to each of these are clearly set out in the appropriate handbooks, with a detailed breakdown of assessment expectations under each criterion both for level 1 and for levels 2 & 3.

*H.ix The educational programmes offered should be supported by an appropriate learning environment. This should include adequate provision of resources, library and ICT, placements and practical opportunities to learn.*

- 112 The college library is open 24 hours a day, with the full-time, qualified Information Officer (librarian) being present during weekdays. The issue of space has been addressed, at least in the short term, by moving most books pre-1960 to an annexe in the organ loft of the chapel, only accessible by stairs. We *suggest* that a clear policy be formulated regarding de-accessioning and archiving. The library is a light and pleasant space for study, and provision is made not only for traditional study tables and chairs but also for a more informal seating area. This has achieved its purpose of encouraging the use of recent journals, especially by those coming in on an occasional basis. There is a small but growing collection of multimedia resources.

- 113 The library budget has this year been considerably increased and a new system introduced of budget allocation under defined categories: BA, BTh, MTh, Chaplaincy, Collection updating, Journals, System. The Methodist Church has allocated £3500 to be used with immediate effect to provide significant expansion of Methodist literature and resources. This year there is additional provision to update the Heritage system to put the catalogue on

line. This will enable students living at a distance to see availability and to use the postal loan service more efficiently. The University Library uses a different system, and it is proposed only to provide a link from the university website to the college site. Complete compatibility of system would entitle all university students to access books at the college, which the inspection team agrees is not a sustainable or sensible option.

- 114 Wireless internet access is available in the library, although during the inspection week it became apparent that this needs frequent rebooting. Four computers are also available for student use in the Talbot Room. There is no dedicated area for students to use voice command systems, provided by the university for those diagnosed with dyslexia. Once provision has been made within study areas and bedrooms for internet access this should not be a problem, but pending this improvement it is difficult for those who need to work 'out loud'.

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion H, Teaching and Learning: Content, Method and Resources.**

## **J THEOLOGY AND PRACTICE**

***Inspectors will consider the way in which the institution understands the relation between theory and practice, how it enables students to develop skills in their integration, and how the overall programme of training is effective in preparing candidates for ordained ministry.***

*J.i The training institution should have a policy on how the curriculum integrates theory and practice and should communicate it to students.*

- 115 The college prizes the integration of theological reflection and ministerial practice in student learning. Although elements of integration are present and encouraged in many aspects of the student's learning, the principal focus for it is the student portfolio and the twice-termly personal tutorial where progress on the portfolio is monitored. The policy is clearly communicated to students in the college's documentation, both prior to their arrival at college and once they begin their course.

*J.ii The structures for learning - courses, seminars, groups, placements, private study, marking, feedback - should be configured so as to facilitate this integration.*

- 116 The college's partnership in the Faculty of Religious and Theological Studies has enabled the inclusion on both the BA and BTh courses of modules specifically devised to facilitate the integration of theory and practice. During the week the inspectors attended a number of lectures where there was clear evidence that students were engaging in a reflective manner, and students at the college expressed a preference for the style of those lecturers who facilitated the making of connections in ways that were comprehensible and relevant to them.

- 117 A commitment to a high level of engagement was also evident in non-residential, chaplaincy and in-service training courses we attended. For instance, in the Introductory Healthcare Chaplaincy Course time for reflective groups was integrated into the daily programme and a rich variety of teaching styles was designed to encourage the reflective participation of those attending. On all such courses we attended students engaged with enthusiasm in discussions and exercises designed to apply theological insights to the demands of practical ministry.
- 118 Placement supervisors whom we met also expressed a strong commitment to encouraging the integration of theory and practice, although some raised significant questions about the shape of the ministry students were being prepared for. The placement supervisors themselves provided an encouraging range of varied models of theological reflection on ministry. See above paragraph 82 for further comment on the placement programme. While a number of first year students commented that they could not see the relevance of some of their academic courses to their placement, the experience of the team was that the portfolios they viewed showed strong evidence of integrative skills being acquired by students. Many students expressed appreciation for the process of building a portfolio. The team was concerned, however, that a significant number acknowledged that they struggled to find adequate time to do it justice.
- 119 See also, under this heading, our comments on tutorial groups and on feedback in paragraphs 84 and 108-109, and Recommendations 6 and 12 above.

*J.iii The institution should demonstrate how it is enabling candidates to develop an appreciation of the pluralist and multi-faith/cultural society in which we live. There should be evidence in the work of students that they are becoming theologically reflective practitioners within it.*

- 120 The college is set in a large multi-cultural city, and at the university students encounter others from a variety of backgrounds. Students on the BTh course take the Level 1 module 'Believing and Belonging' which presents students with questions and issues related to non-Christian faith communities, while those on the BA course take two modules entitled 'Religion, Culture and Society'. Residential students spoke appreciatively of being able to do their placement in a multi-faith chaplaincy team, although in at least one case there was little evidence of profound reflection on the issues. The inspection team is encouraged by the development of the Centre for Chaplaincy Studies which offers an increasing and significant opportunity for students to address issues of pluralism and multicultural experience; we anticipate that a valuable new dimension will be added to training as this expertise is allowed to permeate the everyday life of the college (see Recommendation 11).

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion J, Theology and Practice.**

## K TRAINING IN PUBLIC WORSHIP

*Inspectors will note the ways in which students are trained to plan, prepare and conduct public worship.*

*K.i The institution should have a policy, available to candidates, on Training in Public Worship. It should ensure that candidates plan, prepare and effectively conduct public worship, including preaching.*

121 All students are given the Formation for Ministry Handbook, which outlines the modules to be covered in the Core Skills programme. A further booklet entitled Core Skills for Ministry Handbook gives more information about these modules, one of which is 'Leading Worship and Preaching'. This subject is covered in the first year for the residential and non-residential students.

122 In addition to the college-based studies, students undertake placements during which they are expected to lead worship and preach under supervision. The frequency with which they do this is laid down in the handbooks. Both the placement supervisor and college staff monitor the preparation and conduct of worship and preaching.

*K.ii The institution should ensure that the policy is adhered to and that proper oversight is exercised over this part of the programme of formation.*

123 Students are required to keep portfolios, in which they collect examples of their work, their supervisor's comments and their own reflections on what they have done. They submit their portfolio to their personal tutor at the beginning of the third term each year. Their personal tutor is expected to work with the student on their portfolio and can give advice. There is as yet no portfolio programme in place for trainee Readers (see paragraph 9 and Recommendation 1).

*K.iii There should be an appropriate policy and practice for reviewing and assessing the leading of worship.*

124 As indicated in paragraph 72, students are expected to receive at least five pieces of feedback per year concerning how they lead worship. Some of these may relate to worship led in the college chapel and others to worship led while on placement. There are clear guidelines given as to how this assessment should be carried out.

*K.iv The student should receive critical and constructive comment, attending to performance, content and process from staff and peers.*

125 There are processes in place for this to happen. We experienced some acts of worship in the college chapel which were presented with much imagination, creativity and great dignity. Students who lead worship in college are expected to seek feedback from tutorial staff and from fellow-students, and those who lead worship on placement to seek feedback from their supervisors

and, where appropriate, from members of the congregation. A detailed feedback form is provided in the Worship Handbook though it is not required that this form be used.

- 126 The college has a clearly stated policy for the evaluation of preaching including supervisors, staff and peer reviews. An appropriate Sermon Evaluation Form is used.
- 127 Worship that takes place in the tutorial groups is less formal. This context would be an appropriate opportunity for critical but constructive comment on that particular act of worship and on the principles of worship in general. Our impression was that this opportunity was not used as creatively as it could have been. (See Recommendation 6.)

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion K, Training in Public Worship**

## **L TEACHING STAFF**

*Inspectors will consider the provision of teaching staff and the policy underlying it, the procedures for appointment of teaching and other staff, and provision for staff development.*

*L.i Appointments should involve appropriate consultation with the relevant sponsoring Churches and partner institutions, and the method for making appointments should be clear and fair to all concerned.*

- 128 The core staff based at the college consists of the Principal and the four Deans (see paragraph 42) together with the Director of the Wales Training Network of the Methodist Church. A further fourteen part-time tutors are involved in delivering the non-residential teaching programmes in Cardiff, Carmarthen and Wrexham (including the St Michael's Tutor for St Asaph Diocese, see paragraph 6). Representatives of the sponsoring churches and of the South Wales Baptist College are included on the panel for the appointment of the core staff. Part-time tutors for the courses outside Cardiff are recruited locally. The inspection team was satisfied that in all cases the appropriate criteria for making appointments were fully met.

*L.ii Recruitment and selection should be in line with current good practice. Job descriptions and conditions of service should be clear at the time of appointment and should be revised at regular intervals.*

- 129 The inspection team was satisfied with the practice of recruitment and selection. Contracts of employment and current job descriptions are in place and the lines of accountability clear. We recognise the difficulty of meeting the college's various requirements in a single appointment, but would draw attention especially to our comments in paragraph 133 (and Recommendation 13) with regard to the importance of appointing a female member of teaching

staff as soon as possible. Similar considerations apply to the need for a fluent Welsh-speaker among the Cardiff-based teaching staff.

*L.iii The number, field of expertise, scholarly and teaching competence of the staff should enable the educational programmes of the institution to be offered at the appropriate levels, both in terms of academic achievement and of preparation for public ministry.*

130 The combined academic competence of the college-based staff (together with the Baptist College staff who share in the university teaching programme) provides a high level of expertise across an impressive range of subject areas, and a number of them have significant publications to their name. During the inspection week, inspectors attended a number of lectures which were delivered in varying styles and with varying levels of formality, and were wholly satisfied that the teaching competence of the staff was well-fitted to students who generally engaged readily in discussion and debate. A significant number of the college's teaching staff are also ordained or exercise leadership roles in a range of different traditions, and the inspectors were satisfied that the experience they bring equips them more than adequately to prepare candidates for public ministry.

131 We note that the bare numbers give the impression of an unusually favourable staff/student ratio. But large parts of the time of three of the Deans (of Non-residential Training, Chaplaincy Studies and Ministry Development) and of the Methodist Tutor are devoted to duties outside the regular teaching programme of the college. Even with the involvement of part-time tutors, the current staffing level is only just adequate to maintain the college's teaching commitments on both the university and the college programmes.

*L.iv The gender, lay/ordained and denominational balance among staff members should enable the institution to offer appropriate models of learning and of ministry, and should comply with denominational guidelines.*

132 The college has appointed two women, both ordained, as honorary personal tutors, and they give substantial time to this significant role, though their part-time status inevitably limits their availability as role-models. The inspection team was seriously concerned, however, that at present there is no full-time female member of the teaching staff in Cardiff. On more than one occasion female students said the absence of a female role-model on the teaching staff had a negative impact on their sense of confidence and a number expressed a wish for greater support both with thinking through the theological issues and with the emotional pressures which could confront them as female students.

133 The inspectors recognise that for any given appointment the college faces a tension between the need to ensure a proper gender balance and the need to appoint the candidate with the best qualifications for that particular post, and that the college is committed to restoring the balance as soon as possible. In the meantime, efforts are being made to provide female role-models in other

ways. The contribution of the two ordained women who act as personal tutors has been mentioned above. The team was pleased to see some women appointed as placement supervisors, although the number remains small; we would **urge** the college to make provision for both female and male students where appropriate to work with a female supervisor. We also noted that on non-residential and chaplaincy courses there is in general a better balance of both male/female and lay/ordained tutors, and were concerned that the balance the college was attempting to model in these areas was not at present reflected in the full-time teaching staff at the college. While the Church in Wales has no formal requirement on the gender balance of staff, the college is at present in breach of the Church of England Guidelines for Colleges, Courses and Schemes Training Women, which expect at least one full-time female member of staff. See also paragraph 60 above.

### **Recommendation 13**

**We recommend that in order to provide suitable female role-models for ordained ministry the college**

- (i) review the process for recruiting new staff, to ensure that suitable female candidates of high calibre are made aware of vacancies;**
- (ii) ensure that, in the absence of such an appointment to the full-time staff, an appropriate gender balance is provided in other aspects of the college's life, particularly in relation to invited preachers, the membership of the Trustees, the identification of placement supervisors, and the inclusion of female scholars in bibliographies.**

*L.v The Institution should have in place an effective framework and programme for the continuing professional development of its staff. All staff are to have annual appraisals.*

134 Staff are involved in ongoing learning and research at a high level, and contribute to the wider life of the Church often in very significant ways. We warmly acknowledge this achievement, especially given the demands and pressures of the workload they carry, and recognise the development of skills and the enrichment of the whole community which come by these means. Sabbatical leave is offered and taken on a regular basis. Two of the Deans and the Methodist Tutor are currently involved in research for doctoral degrees. In addition, the college has offered training in theological reflection for those involved in monitoring the portfolios and has called on the expertise of a therapist to facilitate training days at regular intervals during the year. See also paragraph 33 above for the availability of university facilities for staff development. Annual appraisals are in place; see paragraph 47 above.

*L.vi. Staff should model an appropriate pattern of spirituality, continuing learning and reflection on practice.*

- 135 During the inspection week we had the opportunity to interview staff, observe them teaching and attend worship where they were leading, presiding or preaching. In conversation members of staff expressed a strong sense of commitment to the vision of the college which sustained them through times of tension or stress. More than one however expressed the view that the workload was unsustainable in the long-term. The inspectors were concerned to find this model mirrored in the workload of the students. (See also paragraph 92 and Recommendation 10 above.) Nonetheless, the inspection team was satisfied from its observations of staff in a variety of contexts that they more than adequately modelled these essential qualities.

**The inspection has confidence with qualifications with regard to Criterion L, Teaching Staff.**

## **M ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF**

*Inspectors will consider the provision of administrative staff, the policy underlying it, and procedures for their appointment.*

*M.i There should be an adequate number of administrative staff for the type of institution and its way of working.*

- 136 Since the last inspection a new Business Manager has been appointed. She has been in post since January 2009 and has a wide ranging remit including overseeing the daily running of the college including Human Resources and finance matters, as well as developing and implementing a new business plan. This appointment is crucial to the future of the college. It has also meant that the work previously done by the Finance Officer (known in the past as the Bursar) with whom she works closely has been redefined, enabling her to concentrate on her work as finance officer and to provide much needed financial support and analysis for the staff.
- 137 As well as the Business Manager and Finance Officer, there are five full-time administrative staff at the college (one of whom is employed by the Representative Body to support the work of the Dean of Ministry Development for 80% of her time) as well as a Housekeeper, Caretaker and Catering Manager (the latter employed by an outside agency under contract to the college). In addition to the Principal's PA who also acts as Course Coordinator for residential training and conference and lettings coordinator, there is administrative support (referred to as Course Coordinators) for the Dean of Non-residential Training and as mentioned above for the Dean of Ministry Development. The work of the Chaplaincy Centre is supported by the Course Coordinators for non residential training and ministry development. The Trustees are looking at ways of providing more support to assist with sourcing additional funding for the Chaplaincy Centre. As part of the administration team the college employs an Information Officer (librarian) and a Receptionist who also provides an agreed level of administrative support for the Finance Officer and the Principal's PA.

138 The Business Manager has drawn up an initial report on the role and workload of the administrative staff which will be presented to the Trustees and the situation will be regularly reviewed.

*M.ii The institution should establish and make known clear lines of responsibility and accountability for its administrative staff*

139 There are clear lines of responsibility and accountability for the staff. The Course Coordinators and the Information Officer are accountable to the relevant Deans in the college, and the Business Manager who is line-managed by the Principal, is line-manager to the Finance Officer and the Receptionist as well as to the Catering Manager, the Caretaker and the Housekeeper.

*M.iii Recruitment and selection should be in line with current good practice. Job descriptions and conditions of service should be clear at the time of appointment, be revised at regular intervals, and include opportunities for professional development. Staff contracts should be provided.*

140 Staff have been provided with revised job descriptions and conditions of service and work on this and on the pay review by a Human Resources consultant is now complete. The administrative staff are provided with standard contracts of employment and recruitment and selection procedures are in line with current good practice. The college has been able to draw on the support of the Human Resources department of the Representative Body of the Church in Wales. The introduction of the SAGE accounting system has been welcomed, and the college should ensure that suitable ongoing training is available to administrative staff as necessary.

*M.iv The institution should ensure that administrative staff know how they can contribute to the decision- making processes of the institution.*

141 While there are clear lines of management in place, it has been recognised that administrative staff have at times felt out of the loop as far as communications within the college are concerned. Among the Business Manager's initiatives to address this is to hold a fortnightly meeting with the administrative staff as a means of improving communications from them and to them from the Trustees and the strategy meetings and also to reintroduce the staff calendar. She is also looking at ways of improving communications with the student body.

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion M, Administrative Staff.**

## N STUDENTS

*Inspectors will examine procedures for admission and suspension or dismissal, for assessing progress during training, for reporting to the sponsoring Church, and for arranging first appointments.*

*N.i Written information for students about admission, welfare, complaints, discipline, assessment, reporting to sponsoring Churches and arrangements for first appointments should be publicly available.*

- 142 All the necessary information about these matters is available in the series of Handbooks. We did not find the format of so many separate Handbooks particularly helpful or easy to use and would **urge** the college where appropriate to consolidate them and streamline the information offered, avoiding unnecessary duplication.
- 143 The information about Disciplinary Policy and Procedure in the Formation for Ministry Handbook (pp 42-3) should take account of Methodist structures.

### **Recommendation 14**

**We recommend that the following text be added to the information about Disciplinary Policy and Procedure in the Formation for Ministry Handbook:**

**'Methodist student ministers are under the oversight of the Wales Training Network Oversight Committee. The Principal will take the steps described on p.43 in conjunction with the Methodist Oversight Tutor and the Oversight Committee. The ultimate decision in disciplinary matters rests with the Oversight Committee. A paper giving full information on the procedures of Oversight Committees is available from the Connexional Team and on the Methodist Church website.'**

*N.ii The Institution should show evidence of compliance with its own policies, and denominational policies where they exist.*

- 144 We were satisfied that the College complies with its policies in these respects. In particular we noted evidence that recently in the case of a student who gave cause for concern the Formation Review process was duly followed, culminating in the student's withdrawal from training. On the question of reporting to sponsoring churches, see above paragraph 91 and Recommendation 9.

*N.iii The decision-making structure of the institution should enable students to take an appropriate part in the institution. Students should take responsibility for their own participation in the institution.*

- 145 We have commented in paragraph 45 above that students appear to be insufficiently involved in the decision-making structures of the college, and

have recommended that this be addressed particularly through the regular inclusion of a student report on the agenda of Trustees' meetings (Recommendation 3). If a student report to the Trustees is to be effective and meaningful, however, it must be the product of proper consultation among the student body. This calls for both accountability by representatives and participation by students. We had concerns in both these areas, particularly as we were informed that (a) there had been no meeting of the student body between September and the meeting that we attended during the inspection week; (b) at a meeting in May 2008 the student constitution was changed to allow the Executive to meet 'as and when necessary' rather than at specified intervals: this meeting was attended by only one other student apart from the Executive itself; (c) the Executive also had not met as a whole since September. We would **urge** the student body, in the interests of community life as a whole, to ensure that properly robust democratic structures are put in place as a matter of urgency.

- 146 The college management is endeavouring to set up better communication with students. At the same time it is important to respect the autonomy of the student body. To facilitate both these objects, we *suggest* that the student body might want to consider setting up a Residents' Meeting to deal with matters affecting the common life of all (housekeeping matters, Health & Safety, facilities for children etc.). The college management could usefully be part of such a meeting. It would also include students' families and tenants.

**The inspection team has confidence with regard to Criterion N, Students.**

## **O CONCLUSION**

- 147 St Michael's College is an impressive institution. We have become aware of a wide and increasing level of trust in the college among church people in Wales, particularly among those who know the college as it now is rather than judging it on the basis of its past history. We believe that that trust is justified, and that as the college continues its ambitious programme of development its contribution to the life of its sponsoring churches will grow even more significant, chiefly but not only in the preparation of candidates for ordained and Reader ministry who will be well equipped to lead their churches through the changing patterns of church life and ministry in twenty-first century Wales.
148. While our confidence in the college is necessarily expressed at some points with qualifications, some of which are the inevitable consequence of the limited resources available to the college, we have no doubt that the college is fit for the purpose of preparing men and women for ministry in the sponsoring churches.

**Overall outcome: The inspection team has confidence with qualifications in St Michael's College for preparing candidates for ordained and Reader ministry.**

# LIST OF RECOMMENDATIONS

## Recommendation 1

We recommend that the Dean of Non-Residential Training invite the Church in Wales to clarify the role of Readers within the Province and agree selection criteria which will apply throughout the Province. The college should then formulate learning outcomes appropriate to this understanding of Reader ministry, and subsequently introduce the use of portfolios for Reader training. (para 9)

## Recommendation 2

We recommend that St Michael's College and the South Wales Baptist College explore ways of promoting contact between them in areas additional to the university-based teaching programme, for instance by planning joint worship, social events, or discussion of matters of common interest. (para 38)

## Recommendation 3

We recommend that the college promote a fuller participation of students in the governance and management of the college, in particular by including a regular report from the student representative on the agenda of Trustees' meetings. (para 45)

## Recommendation 4

We recommend that the works already identified as essential to meet statutory requirements for safety and disability access be carried out without delay. (para 56)

## Recommendation 5

We recommend that early in the next academic year, after allowing for an initial settling-in period, the college engage external consultants to facilitate an opportunity for the whole residential community to work on issues of living together in diversity, and that the need for such a session in future years be kept under review. (para 65)

## Recommendation 6

We recommend that the college review the aims and effectiveness of tutorial group meetings, with particular attention to

- (i) providing a more structured environment for interaction and constructive reflection and feedback in a 'safe' environment;
- (ii) promoting creative but critical analysis of the principles of worship, especially in a group context. (para 84)

### **Recommendation 7**

**We recommend that the college strengthen the role of pastoral care of students through:**

- (i) ensuring that personal tutors are able to be regularly available in college and present at college worship whenever possible;**
- (ii) ensuring that all students have regular meetings with tutors according to the college's guidelines;**
- (iii) ensuring that chaplains are regularly present in college, and are available to provide confidential support as needed;**
- (iv) actively encouraging students to find spiritual directors who take no other part in any area of their training. (para 86)**

### **Recommendation 8**

**We recommend that the college give further attention to enabling both ordinands and trainee Readers to understand the theology, theory and practice of ministry teams and collaborative ministry. (para 89)**

### **Recommendation 9**

**We recommend that the college seek a clear understanding of what the relevant church authorities require in the annual reports on students, and that such reports be detailed and objective. (para 91)**

### **Recommendation 10**

**We recommend that the college regularly review the relationship between the requirements of the academic curriculum and of the courses relating to pastoral formation, to ensure an appropriate balance, with adequate time for prayer and reflection and, importantly, for the students' family and personal life, thus modelling an appropriate work/life balance for their future ministry. (para 92)**

### **Recommendation 11**

**We recommend that the college seek ways of incorporating appropriate insights developed in the Centre for Chaplaincy Studies into the general ministerial training, particularly as it relates to exploring the interface between theology and public life. (para 102)**

### **Recommendation 12**

**We recommend that both colleges work with the School of Religious and Theological Studies to ensure that students receive adequate feedback on their assessed work both formative and summative. (para 108)**

### **Recommendation 13**

**We recommend that in order to provide suitable female role-models for ordained ministry the college**

- (i) review the process for recruiting new staff, to ensure that suitable female candidates of high calibre are made aware of vacancies;**
- (ii) ensure that, in the absence of such an appointment to the full-time staff, an appropriate gender balance is provided in other aspects of the college's life, particularly in relation to invited preachers, the membership of the Trustees, the identification of placement supervisors, and the inclusion of female scholars in bibliographies. (para 133)**

### **Recommendation 14**

**We recommend that the following text be added to the information about Disciplinary Policy and Procedure in the Formation for Ministry Handbook:**

**'Methodist student ministers are under the oversight of the Wales Training Network Oversight Committee. The Principal will take the steps described on p.43 in conjunction with the Methodist Oversight Tutor and the Oversight Committee. The ultimate decision in disciplinary matters rests with the Oversight Committee. A paper giving full information on the procedures of Oversight Committees is available from the Connexional Team and on the Methodist Church website.'** (para 143)